

## COLLOQUIA

**Friday, November 8 | 10:45 a.m.-12 p.m.**

---

**‘By This, Everyone Will Know that You Are My Disciples’ (Jn 13:35)**

**ROOM 158 | Moderator: Rev. Augustine Reisenauer, O.P.**

**“Absent Friends: The Loss of the Treatise on Friendship in Catholic Moral Theology and Suggestions for Recovery”**

**Fr. Daniel Fitzpatrick (Pontifical Scots College)**

The ancient philosophers and the Church Fathers both thought that human friendship was a significant aspect of human fulfillment and reflected on it in their writings. Thus, the treatise on friendship became part of theological reflection until the rise of Nominalist thinking and the new approach to moral theology that developed from it, which dropped it from its consideration. This paper will examine some of the reasons for that change and look at how friendship can reclaim its place in moral theology in the light of some recent approaches in the field.

**Bio**

Father Fitzpatrick is currently the Rector of the Pontifical Scots College in Rome and also a lecturer in Moral Theology at the Pontifical Bede College. He graduated in Medicine from Glasgow University in 1990 and studied philosophy and theology at the Gregorian University in Rome before doing licence studies at the Alphonsian Academy there. He became an ordained priest in 2001; serving in several parishes in the Diocese of Paisley. He served on the Catholic Bishops Joint Bioethics Committee of England, Ireland and Scotland and was also a governor of the Anscombe Bioethics Centre. Fr. Fitzpatrick returned to Rome as Vice Rector of the Pontifical Scots College in 2012 before taking up his current role in 2015.

**“Diligence in Friendship: Simon Peter between Ephrem and Theodoret”**

**Andrew Hayes (The University of St. Thomas)**

Theodoret’s *Treatise on Divine Love*, which serves as a scripturally tinged epilogue to his accounts of the ascetics of the Syrian Orient, contains a neglected interpretation of Simon Peter’s threefold confession of Christ: that Peter’s confession speaks less to his failure than to his indefatigable diligence, his willingness to persist in Christ’s friendship despite the risk of sin. A similar concept appears in St. Ephrem the Syrian. Together they add diligence to the Christian

understanding of friendship, a concept which defocuses the notion of patronage but tends to resolve the hubris that Christian friendship with God apparently implies.

### **Bio**

Andrew Hayes specializes in the study of Syriac and early Christian Arabic literature, exploring Christian spirituality in these vibrant traditions through the lens of their literary artistry. He is Associate Professor and Chairman of the Theology Department at the University of St. Thomas, Houston.

### **“Friendship with God in Early Greek Patristic Theology”**

#### **John Sehorn (Augustine Institute)**

Irenaeus of Lyons (c. 135–200) and Clement of Alexandria (c. 150–215) emphasize distinct but complementary aspects of friendship with God through Christ (John 15:13–15). Irenaeus’s project of showing the unity of the two testaments leads him to highlight covenantal faith and obedience. Abraham is thus, for Irenaeus, the paradigmatic “friend of God.” Clement, who is concerned with the relationship between revelation and philosophy, gravitates towards Moses’s contemplative “face-to-face” relationship with God as the model of divine friendship. Both Irenaeus and Clement see deification as the term of divine friendship, a conviction well-founded in John’s Gospel.

### **Bio**

John earned his MA in Early Christian Studies and PhD in History of Christianity at Notre Dame. He is currently Assistant Professor of Theology at the Augustine Institute in Colorado. He focuses on patristics and Scripture, and he is currently co-editing a forthcoming series from Baker Academic, *From the Side of Christ: A Biblical Theology of the Sacraments*.

---

## **Living in Darkness**

**ROOM 159 | Moderator: Brett Robinson**

### **“Friendship, Faith, and Testimony: An Existential Take”**

#### **Robert James Lisowski, C.S.C. (University of Notre Dame)**

While the postmodern world has long dismissed the importance of relating to a transcendent God, there still exists a hunger for authentic friendship. The French existentialist Gabriel Marcel highlights that personal fulfillment is only found in relationships of trust and commitment. It is in such relationships that I not only discover myself but also make contact with the eternal.

Therefore, Marcel's philosophy provides a vision for responding to the contemporary crisis of loneliness, while also addressing the inseparable question of friendship with God.

### **Bio**

Robert James Lisowski, C.S.C. is a professed seminarian in the Congregation of Holy Cross and a graduate student in theology at the University of Notre Dame. A native of Scranton Pennsylvania, Robert did his undergraduate work in philosophy and psychology at St. John's University in Queens, New York. His research interests include philosophy of religion, French existentialism, and John Henry Newman.

### **“On Digital Friendship: An Outlook From the Magisterium of the Church”**

#### **Rev. Jordi Pujol (Pontifical University of the Holy Cross)**

In 2009, three years after Facebook was publicly launched, Benedict XVI wrote on the concept of friendship in new digital networks, underlining that friendship is “one of the noblest achievements of human culture,” and warned about the risk of “trivializing it.” I will explore the Church pronouncements on “digital friendship” since the beginning of the social networks in the early 2000s through the present day. I'll particularly examine the Facebook case, for its goal to ‘connect people’ and ‘build community,’ and for in March 2019, it is still the most used network platform with 2,28 billion monthly active users.

### **Bio**

Rev. Jorge Pujol is Assistant Professor of Media Ethics and Law at the School of Church Communications in the Pontifical University of the Holy Cross in Rome. Fr. Pujol is from Barcelona and has a master degree in law and in moral theology from the Pontifical University of the Holy Cross in Rome. He received his PhD in Moral Theology in November 2017 with a dissertation on the moral principles of freedom of expression. In 2016-2017 he was a Visiting Research Fellow at the University of Notre Dame for the de Nicola Center for Ethics and Culture. He was also Visiting Scholar at Columbia School of Journalism.

### **“Friendship's Pre-moral Foundations: Hildebrand's *Art of Living* as a Guide to Founding True Friendships that Heal Social Discord”**

#### **Andrew Wachs (Duquesne University)**

The nature of friendship has been radically relativized in the current historical moment by rise of “Facebook friendship.” People less than acquaintances are considered friends while long-time friends can be deleted at a moment's notice. This digital practice has bled into the real world with the rise of “ghosting” interpersonal relationships. In effect, the moral weight of friendship has been all but lost in our secular age. This paper analyzes how Dietrich von Hildebrand's

recently released *The Art of Living* can be utilized to teach the art of fruitful and faithful friendship in the current historical moment.

### **Bio**

Anthony M. Wachs is Assistant Professor of Rhetoric, Communication Ethics & the Catholic Intellectual Tradition at Duquesne University in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania where he teaches courses on the intersections of rhetoric, religion, technology, and human relationships. He has published articles on these topics and is the author of *The New Science of Communication: Reconsidering McLuhan's Message for Our Modern Moment* and co-author of the forthcoming book *Age of Anxiety: Meaning, Identity, and Politics in 21st Century Film and Literature*.

---

## **‘To Discover that We Actually Belong Together’ (Jean Vanier)**

**ROOM 160 | Moderator: Bridgid Smith**

### **“Neighbors and Friends: A Vision of People with Disabilities”**

#### **David Coulter (Harvard Medical School)**

Jean Vanier showed us what it means to call people with disabilities neighbors and friends and how to live with them in community. This project seeks to extend that vision worldwide. I will present the new Community Imperative (CI) which has been endorsed by many national developmental disability associations. The new CI (summarized below) builds on the original CI issued by Burton Blatt in 1978 which helped end institutional care and promoted community living. But it is not enough for people with disabilities to be in the community. They must be of the community as valued neighbors and friends.

### **Bio**

David Coulter graduated in 1969 from the University of Notre Dame. His subsequent journeys have taken him to Yale Medical School, residencies in pediatrics and neurology, and a series of academic positions culminating in his current status as an associate professor of neurology at Harvard Medical School and clinical child neurologist at Boston Children's Hospital. David has personally cared for more than 10,000 kids with intellectual and developmental disabilities in his career. He has also published four books of poetry which are available in the Hammes Notre Dame Bookstore. David received the 2017 national award for humanism in medicine from the Child Neurology Society and the 2019 national humanitarian award from the American Association on Intellectual and Developmental Disabilities. He co-edited the *Journal of Religion, Disability and Health* for ten years. David completed Harvard fellowships in ethics and in chaplaincy and is currently a faculty associate at the Harvard Center for Bioethics.

## **“Building a Christian Community: Friendship, Homophily, and the Benedict Option”**

**Audra Dugandzic (University of Notre Dame)**

This paper presents findings from fieldwork conducted in Hyattsville, Maryland, a purported example of Rod Dreher’s Benedict Option. In this paper, I reflect on the following question: In the context of religious and community decline, what are the benefits and drawbacks to organizing community life around elective friendships? I argue that, while friendships grounded in faith are critical to maintaining and strengthening religious practice, the Benedict Option and other intentional communities are susceptible to the downsides of homophily, i.e. the human tendency to form ties with people like themselves. Christians must instead work toward radical structural changes to overcome declining religiosity and community.

### **Bio**

Audra Dugandzic is a third year PhD student in sociology at the University of Notre Dame. Broadly, her work explores religion's relationship to modernity, and she is currently a researcher on the Notre Dame Undergraduate Religion and Spirituality Longitudinal Study. Before coming to Notre Dame she was an associate analyst at Abt Associates and *Via Sapientiae* Fellow at *Ethika Politika*. She earned her bachelor's degree in psychology and politics from The Catholic University of America.

## **“Living L’Arche: A Radical Friendship with Vulnerability and Belonging”**

**Clare Scantling (University of Toledo)**

What is it about the way of living in L’Arche—amongst people of all ages, backgrounds, abilities, and stories—that fosters true belonging in these most unlikely of encounters? People with disabilities open wide the gates of belonging and transform the hearts of those who encounter them, most especially those whom they befriend, precisely because of their vulnerability and interdependency. L’Arche embodies being with one another in kinship, and it is in this way that it serves as a lighthouse in a world in danger of losing the capacity to see and understand and befriend those most different.

### **Bio**

Clare Scantling is currently a first year medical student at the University of Toledo College of Medicine. After completing her bachelor's degree at the University of Notre Dame, studying pre-medicine and theology, Clare spent a year living in a L’Arche community in Seattle, Washington. Among the formative experiences and encounters on her path to becoming a physician—including the Sorin Fellowship Program, psychosocial research with the Hillebrand Compassionate Care in Medicine Team, and leadership as a Resident Assistant—the ethos of L’Arche is at the heart of it all. Clare is with us today to reflect on her time with L’Arche and

what she has learned from her most profound teachers and friends: her housemates with intellectual and developmental disabilities.

---

**Embodied Friendship**  
**ROOM 161 | Moderator: Dominic Vachon**

**“Why Physicians Need Friendship”**

**Lauris Kaldjian (University of Iowa College of Medicine)**

Medicine is increasingly socially constructed and straying from its traditional goals. There is less moral solidarity to unite professional companions in a common vision of health and healthcare. Physicians therefore need friendship now more than ever. From ancient, medieval, and modern writers, we see the contours of friendship in fellowship that is preferential, reciprocal, ready to include, and joyful in what is held in common—especially the ability to see and follow the same truth. For Christian physicians, friendship is a divine blessing that cultivates virtue and encourages loving service to God and the patient as neighbor.

**Bio**

Lauris Kaldjian directs the Program in Bioethics and Humanities at the University of Iowa Carver College of Medicine, where he is professor of Internal Medicine and holds the Caplan Chair in Biomedical Ethics and Medical Humanities. He received his M.D. from the University of Michigan, an M.Div. and PhD in Christian Ethics from Yale, where he also completed his clinical training in internal medicine and infectious diseases. His research interests have included clinical ethics and practical wisdom in medicine, and in 2014 he published *Practicing Medicine and Ethics: Integrating Wisdom, Conscience, and Goals of Care* (Cambridge University Press).

**“What Can Withstand the Test of Time? Of Friendship in Science and Medicine”**

**Andrea Mariani (Mayo Clinic Rochester) and Nadeem Abu-Rustum (Memorial Sloan Kettering Cancer Center)**

In our talk we will share our personal life journeys. We will tell our story, which is an example of how friendship helped us staying faithful to our true call of being doctors and scientists: to do a science for the patient and to sustain a “human gaze” on the sick person. We propose that both of us (Dr Andrea Mariani and Dr Abu Rustum) come together to tell the story of our friendship.

## **“Unbefriended Patients: Why Friendship May Not Be the Answer”**

**Bryan Pilkington (Seton Hall University)**

Patients who need, but lack, surrogate decision makers are often called “unbefriended patients.” Unbefriended patients raise a challenge for clinical ethics consultation (CEC), especially when no advanced care directive or healthcare proxy exists, because the patient’s values are unknown. Such situations offer few resources for CEC consultants, due to the limited and limiting nature of the values-focused framework of contemporary bioethics, which governs CEC. I argue, seemingly paradoxically, that what unbefriended patients need is not a friend, but a change within CEC practice from relation-focused to information-building decision-making. This response raises another question: can CEC consultants make the good of patients their own?

### **Bio**

Bryan Pilkington, PhD, works in bioethics and philosophy. His research focuses on questions of conscience, moral responsibility, the ethics of healthcare practice, and the concept of dignity. He lectures on practical ethical challenges in healthcare and teaches courses in normative and applied ethics, including courses in ethical theory, bioethics, environmental ethics, and political philosophy. Pilkington currently serves on the Editorial Board of the *Journal of Medicine and Philosophy*, *HealthCare Ethics Committee Forum*, and *Christian Bioethics*. He is a Junior Scholar in Bioethics at the Paul Ramsey Institute, and holds appointments in Seton Hall University’s School of Health and Medical Sciences, Hackensack Meridian School of Medicine, College of Nursing, and Department of Philosophy.

---

## **Civic Life and Personal Friendship ROOM 162 | Moderator: Mary Keys**

### **“Political Friendship in the Conflicts of Modernity”**

**Ricardo Calleja (University of Navarra)**

Political friendship is the kind of friendship that unites those who recognize they have a (political) common good and cooperate explicitly in pursuing that common good, even if they do not always agree on the adequate determinations of what that common good demands. Is political friendship thus defined a form of basic human good? Is it possible to cultivate such type of friendship in the late liberal order? How is personal friendship related to specifically political friendship? In this paper, I will address those questions by entering in a dialogue with some central authors, in particular Finnis and MacIntyre.

## **Bio**

Ricardo Calleja is a Lecturer at the Business Ethics Department of IESE Business School of the University of Navarra. He holds a PhD in Legal and Political Philosophy from the Universidad Complutense de Madrid and has been a visiting scholar at Mendoza College of Business here at Notre Dame. At IESE he teaches business ethics, negotiation and philosophical anthropology. His research is focused on questions regarding the practice of political prudence in leading business organizations; the common good of business organizations, and their contribution (if any) to the common good of society at large; and questions around the ethics of current digital technologies.

## **“No Greater Love: Is Giving One’s Life for One’s Friends a Secular or Religious Value?”**

### **Richard Doerflinger (de Nicola Center for Ethics and Culture)**

I propose that the ultimate "sincere gift of self," giving one's life for one's friends, cannot easily be pigeon-holed as either "sectarian" or purely secular. This is discussed in terms of the majority and dissenting opinions in the recent Supreme Court opinion on the Peace Cross in Bladensburg, MD, both of which missed this perspective. Here also is a column I wrote in 2017 at a much earlier stage of this judicial process, in which I began to float this idea:

<https://www.archbalt.org/no-greater-love-2/>

## **Bio**

Richard Doerflinger has a master of arts in divinity from the University of Chicago and has pursued doctoral studies in theology there and at the Catholic University of America. In 2016, he retired from the Secretariat of Pro-Life Activities at the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops, where for thirty-six years he prepared policy statements, teaching materials and congressional testimony on abortion, euthanasia and other medical-moral issues. He has published in many journals and magazines, and his syndicated column “A More Human Society” is distributed by Catholic News Service. He is a Vita Faculty Fellow at the University of Notre Dame’s de Nicola Center for Ethics and Culture and an associate scholar at the Charlotte Lozier Institute. He and his wife Lee Ann live in La Conner, Washington.

## **“Family and Civic Friendship”**

### **Daniel Mark (Villanova University)**

Liberalism has been criticized for its overemphasis on individualism and rights. While these aspects of liberalism can be dangerous, a liberal society can flourish where there is civic friendship based on the family. A family, with its emphasis on commitment, obligation, and sacrifice, serves as a model for advancing the common good whereby members put the needs of others ahead of their own rights. That is, the family shows how to introduce mercy into justice.



For family-like civic friendship to grow, citizens must encounter each other through robust civic life beyond the impersonal market or the contentious political arena.

**Bio**

Daniel Mark is an assistant professor of political science at Villanova University. He recently served as chairman of the US Commission on International Religious Freedom. At Villanova, Daniel is a faculty associate of the Ryan Center and the battalion professor for the Navy ROTC unit. For the 2017-18 academic year, Daniel was a visiting fellow at the University of Notre Dame. Daniel is a fellow of the Witherspoon Institute, an affiliated scholar of the James Wilson Institute, and an instructor for the Tikvah Fund. He is a founding board member of the Jewish Coalition for Religious Liberty; on the advisory council of CanaVox; and on the board of advisors of the Blackstone and Burke Center for Law and Liberty at Faulker University's law school. He holds a BA, MA, and PhD from the Department of Politics at Princeton University, where he studied under Professor Robert George.